

# Search-based Similarity-driven Behavioural SPL Testing: Evaluation Results

Xavier Devroey

November 18, 2015

## 1 Soda vending machine

### 1.1 Optimal Configurations of the Algorithm

1. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.056$ )
2. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.056$ )
3. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.056$ )
4. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.056$ )
5. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.037$ )
6. Dice mul., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.037$ )
7. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.037$ )
8. Dice avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.037$ )
9. Dice avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
10. All-actions ( $freq. = 0.028$ )
11. Hamming sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
12. Dice mul., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
13. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
14. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
15. Dice avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
16. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
17. Dice mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.028$ )
18. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
19. Levenshtein avg., local,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
20. Dice avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
21. Hamming mul., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
22. Dice mul., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
23. Levenshtein sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
24. Jaccard sing., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
25. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
26. Dice avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
27. Dice avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )
28. Hamming mul., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.019$ )

29. Dice mul., local,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
30. Dice sing., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
31. Dice avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
32. Levenshtein sing., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
33. Levenshtein mul., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
34. Jaccard sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
35. Levenshtein avg., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
36. Hamming sing., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
37. Levenshtein mul., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
38. Levenshtein avg., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
39. Hamming avg., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
40. Jaccard avg., local,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
41. Dice avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
42. Dice sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
43. Hamming avg., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
44. Hamming sing., local,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
45. Hamming avg., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
46. Dice avg., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )
47. Dice avg., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.009$ )

## 1.2 Hypervolumes

|                               | $t$ | Dissimilar crit. |       |       |         |       |       |       |       |       |          |       |       |             |       |       |
|-------------------------------|-----|------------------|-------|-------|---------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|----------|-------|-------|-------------|-------|-------|
|                               |     | Hamming          |       |       | Jaccard |       |       | Dice  |       |       | Antidice |       |       | Levenshtein |       |       |
|                               |     | Avg.             | Mul.  | Sing. | Avg.    | Mul.  | Sing. | Avg.  | Mul.  | Sing. | Avg.     | Mul.  | Sing. | Avg.        | Mul.  | Sing. |
| Loc.<br>sort                  | 1   | 0.917            | 0.917 | 0.917 | 0.917   | 0.829 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.917    | 0.963 | 0.750 | 0.976       | 0.917 | 0.828 |
|                               | 2   | 0.833            | 0.917 | 0.917 | 0.750   | 0.746 | 0.980 | 0.833 | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.917    | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.708       | 0.986 | 0.917 |
|                               | 10  | 0.917            | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.833   | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.823 | 0.968 | 0.824 | 0.823    | 0.833 | 0.917 | 0.825       | 0.917 | 0.833 |
| Glob.<br>sort                 | 100 | 0.917            | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.917   | 0.833 | 0.814 | 0.750 | 0.978 | 0.833 | 0.750    | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.990       | 0.826 | 0.917 |
|                               | 1   | 0.917            | 0.917 | 0.750 | 0.833   | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833    | 0.917 | 0.917 | 0.833       | 0.833 | 0.833 |
|                               | 2   | 0.750            | 0.917 | 0.750 | 0.833   | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833    | 0.917 | 0.917 | 0.833       | 0.833 | 0.833 |
| All-act. crit.<br>Rand. crit. | 100 | 0.917            | 0.917 | 0.750 | 0.833   | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833 | 0.917 | 0.833 | 0.833    | 0.917 | 0.917 | 0.833       | 0.833 | 0.833 |
|                               |     | 0.917            |       |       | 0.767   |       |       |       |       |       |          |       |       |             |       |       |

## 2 Minepump

### 2.1 Optimal Configurations of the Algorithm

1. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.222$ )
2. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.222$ )
3. Dice sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.222$ )
4. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.111$ )
5. Dice avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.111$ )
6. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.111$ )

## 2.2 Hypervolumes

|                       | <i>t</i> | Dissimilar crit. |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |
|-----------------------|----------|------------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|
|                       |          | Hamming          |             |              | Jaccard     |             |              | Dice        |             |              | Antidice    |             |              | Levenshtein |             |              |
|                       |          | <i>Avg.</i>      | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> |
|                       | 1        | 0.855            | 0.873       | 0.858        | 0.912       | 0.883       | 0.947        | 0.963       | 0.845       | 0.773        | 0.859       | 0.846       | 0.844        | 0.795       | 0.925       | 0.894        |
| Loc.                  | 2        | 0.905            | 0.710       | 0.967        | 0.938       | 0.930       | 0.788        | 0.777       | 0.913       | 0.802        | 0.772       | 0.758       | 0.720        | 0.828       | 0.919       | 0.852        |
| sort                  | 10       | 0.838            | 0.950       | 0.769        | 0.874       | 0.869       | 0.756        | 0.861       | 0.766       | 0.865        | 0.965       | 0.758       | 0.956        | 0.688       | 0.854       | 0.892        |
|                       | 100      | 0.935            | 0.844       | 0.817        | 0.944       | 0.808       | 0.841        | 0.805       | 0.869       | 0.856        | 0.861       | 0.900       | 0.858        | 0.880       | 0.858       | 0.734        |
|                       | 1        | 0.998            | 0.970       | 0.833        | 0.984       | 0.949       | 0.860        | 0.967       | 0.965       | 0.810        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.878        | 0.998       | 0.954       | 0.811        |
| Glob.                 | 2        | 0.982            | 0.944       | 0.895        | 1.000       | 0.965       | 0.827        | 0.982       | 0.978       | 0.931        | 0.983       | 0.978       | 0.910        | 0.984       | 0.949       | 0.872        |
| sort                  | 10       | 0.977            | 0.935       | 0.781        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.912        | 0.967       | 0.999       | 0.935        | 0.981       | 0.967       | 0.879        | 0.981       | 0.967       | 0.895        |
|                       | 100      | 0.979            | 0.933       | 0.692        | 1.000       | 0.969       | 0.876        | 0.962       | 0.997       | 0.818        | 0.983       | 0.983       | 0.941        | 0.967       | 0.983       | 0.812        |
| <b>All-act. crit.</b> |          | 0.965            |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |
| <b>Rand. crit.</b>    |          | 0.821            |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |

## 3 Card payment terminal

### 3.1 Optimal Configurations of the Algorithm

1. Dice sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.029$ )
2. Dice mul., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.029$ )
3. Dice avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.029$ )
4. Levenshtein sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.029$ )
5. Dice avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
6. Dice avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
7. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
8. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
9. Dice mul., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
10. Dice avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
11. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
12. Dice avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
13. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
14. Dice sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
15. Dice avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
16. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
17. Dice avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
18. Dice sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
19. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
20. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
21. Dice sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
22. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.024$ )
23. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
24. Levenshtein sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
25. Dice sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
26. Levenshtein avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
27. Levenshtein avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )

28. Dice avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
29. Jaccard mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
30. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
31. Hamming avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
32. Levenshtein sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.018$ )
33. Levenshtein sing., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
34. Jaccard sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
35. Levenshtein mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
36. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
37. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
38. Jaccard avg., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
39. Dice mul., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
40. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
41. Dice sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
42. Levenshtein mul., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
43. Dice sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
44. Jaccard mul., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
45. Dice sing., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
46. Levenshtein mul., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
47. Dice mul., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
48. Dice mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.012$ )
49. Levenshtein mul., local,  $t = 10$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
50. Dice mul., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
51. Levenshtein avg., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
52. Levenshtein avg., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
53. Hamming sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
54. Levenshtein mul., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
55. Jaccard mul., global,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
56. All-actions ( $freq. = 0.006$ )
57. Levenshtein avg., local,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
58. Dice avg., local,  $t = 2$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
59. Levenshtein sing., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
60. Random ( $freq. = 0.006$ )
61. Hamming mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
62. Dice mul., global,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
63. Jaccard sing., local,  $t = 1$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )
64. Hamming mul., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 0.006$ )

## 3.2 Hypervolumes

|                               | <i>t</i> | Hamming     |             |              | Jaccard     |             |              | Dissimilar crit. |             |              | Antidice    |             |              | Levenshtein |             |              |
|-------------------------------|----------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|------------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|
|                               |          | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i>      | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> |
| Loc.<br>sort                  | 1        | 1.000       | 0.936       | 0.926        | 1.000       | 0.952       | 0.958        | 0.958            | 0.925       | 0.963        | 0.841       | 0.886       | 1.000        | 0.892       | 0.952       | 0.963        |
|                               | 2        | 0.905       | 0.958       | 0.903        | 0.969       | 0.917       | 0.958        | 0.958            | 1.000       | 0.952        | 0.889       | 0.903       | 0.952        | 0.963       | 0.967       | 0.981        |
|                               | 10       | 0.903       | 0.958       | 0.915        | 0.952       | 0.952       | 0.952        | 0.815            | 0.897       | 0.967        | 0.952       | 0.921       | 0.952        | 0.764       | 0.967       | 1.000        |
| Glob.<br>sort                 | 100      | 0.963       | 0.963       | 0.963        | 0.886       | 0.917       | 0.917        | 0.878            | 0.967       | 0.917        | 0.758       | 0.897       | 0.915        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        |
|                               | 1        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000            | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        |
|                               | 2        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.628        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000            | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        |
| All-act. crit.<br>Rand. crit. | 10       | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.649        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.958        | 1.000            | 1.000       | 0.926        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 0.944        |
|                               | 100      | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000            | 0.936       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        | 1.000       | 1.000       | 1.000        |
|                               |          | 1.000       |             |              |             |             |              |                  |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |

## 4 Claroline

### 4.1 Optimal Configurations of the Algorithm

1. Hamming sing., global,  $t = 100$  ( $freq = 1.0$ )

### 4.2 Hypervolumes

|                               | <i>t</i> | Hamming     |             |              | Jaccard     |             |              | Dissimilar crit. |             |              | Antidice    |             |              | Levenshtein |             |              |
|-------------------------------|----------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|------------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|
|                               |          | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i>      | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> | <i>Avg.</i> | <i>Mul.</i> | <i>Sing.</i> |
| Loc.<br>sort                  | 1        | 0.690       | 0.688       | 0.662        | 0.690       | 0.673       | 0.705        | 0.690            | 0.693       | 0.709        | 0.668       | 0.711       | 0.692        | 0.691       | 0.691       | 0.722        |
|                               | 2        | 0.705       | 0.674       | 0.699        | 0.684       | 0.679       | 0.673        | 0.670            | 0.667       | 0.689        | 0.659       | 0.688       | 0.690        | 0.677       | 0.666       | 0.662        |
|                               | 10       | 0.661       | 0.702       | 0.681        | 0.700       | 0.721       | 0.685        | 0.679            | 0.720       | 0.669        | 0.651       | 0.667       | 0.674        | 0.696       | 0.691       | 0.681        |
| Glob.<br>sort                 | 100      | 0.672       | 0.667       | 0.693        | 0.713       | 0.672       | 0.720        | 0.678            | 0.691       | 0.703        | 0.655       | 0.696       | 0.685        | 0.687       | 0.655       | 0.678        |
|                               | 1        | 0.724       | 0.736       | 0.710        | 0.727       | 0.694       | 0.697        | 0.710            | 0.695       | 0.683        | 0.699       | 0.666       | 0.672        | 0.717       | 0.684       | 0.693        |
|                               | 2        | 0.755       | 0.711       | 0.708        | 0.715       | 0.722       | 0.718        | 0.729            | 0.723       | 0.670        | 0.728       | 0.677       | 0.705        | 0.733       | 0.708       | 0.687        |
| All-act. crit.<br>Rand. crit. | 10       | 0.804       | 0.740       | 0.733        | 0.730       | 0.723       | 0.696        | 0.738            | 0.690       | 0.683        | 0.746       | 0.701       | 0.692        | 0.771       | 0.701       | 0.714        |
|                               | 100      | 0.831       | 0.794       | 0.800        | 0.756       | 0.747       | 0.729        | 0.755            | 0.750       | 0.714        | 0.758       | 0.747       | 0.740        | 0.781       | 0.747       | 0.730        |
|                               |          | 0.771       |             |              |             |             |              |                  |             |              |             |             |              |             |             |              |